

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

WILLIAM C. TOTH, JR., et al.,  
*Plaintiffs,*

v.

LEIGH M. CHAPMAN, in her official  
capacity as Acting Secretary of the  
Commonwealth; JESSICA MATHIS, in  
her official capacity as Director for the  
Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services  
and Notaries; and TOM WOLF, in his  
official capacity as Governor of  
Pennsylvania,

*Defendants.*

No. 1:22 Civ. 208  
(Jordan, Shwartz, Wilson, JJ.)

Electronically Filed

**SUMMARY JUDGMENT JOINT APPENDIX**

Application for Leave to Intervene by Bryan Cutler, Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives; Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania House Of Representatives; Jake Corman, President Pro Tempore of the Pennsylvania Senate; and Kim Ward, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania Senate (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021) .....	A1
Expert Report of Jonathan Rodden, Ph.D. (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021) .....	A54

Corrected Opening Brief of House Republican Intervenors Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader, and Bryan Cutler, Speaker, of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives in Support of Proposed Congressional Redistricting Map (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A79
Report on Proposed Congressional Redistricting Plan from the Pennsylvania House Republican Caucus (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021) .....	A236
Responsive Expert Report of Jonathan Rodden, Ph.D. (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A287
January 27, 2022 Hearing Transcript of Proceedings before Special Master (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A299
January 28, 2022 Hearing Transcript of Proceedings before Special Master (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021).....	A971
Report Containing Special Master’s Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law Supporting Recommendation of Congressional Redistricting Plan and Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule (Pa. Commw. Ct. Nos. 464, 465 MD 2021) .....	A1421
Carter Petitioners’ Exceptions to the Special Master’s Report and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1649
Gressman Math/Science Petitioners’ Exceptions to Special Master’s Report and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1719
Respondents’ Exceptions Regarding the Special Master’s Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule and Incorporated Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1825
Intervenor-Respondent Governor Thomas W. Wolf’s Exceptions to the Special Master’s Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Incorporated Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1849
Exceptions of Senator Jay Costa and the Senate Democratic Caucus to the February 7, 2022 Report of the Special Master and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A1975

Brief of Intervenor, Representative Joanna E. McClinton, Leader of the Democratic Caucus of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives in Support of Her Exceptions to the February 7, 2022 Report of the Special Master (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2082
Senate Republican Intervenors’ Brief in Support of Report and Recommendation of Special Master (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2119
Brief of Intervenors Bryan Cutler, Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, and Kerry Benninghoff, Majority Leader of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, in Support of Judge McCullough’s Report and Recommendation (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2138
Exceptions to Special Master’s Report by Guy Reschenthaler, Jeffrey Varner, Ryan Costello, Tom Marino, and Bud Shuster and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2201
Exceptions to Report of Special Master of Amici Khalif Ali, Maryn Formley, Richard Rafferty, Patrick Beaty, Susan Gobreski, Barbara Hill, Judy Hines, Jodi Greene, John Thompson, Cynthia Alvarado, and Timothy L. Kauffman and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2278
Exceptions of Draw the Lines PA Amicus Participants to the February 7, 2022 Report and Recommendation and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2324
Amicus Participants’ (“Citizen-Voters”) Exceptions to Report Containing Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Brief in Support Thereof (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2361
Brief of Amici Curiae Voters of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania in Support of Special Master’s Report (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2403
Brief of Amici Curiae Concerned Citizens for Democracy in Support of Petitioners (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2478
Brief for Amicus Curiae Philadelphia County Board of Elections in Support of Neither Party (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2537
Amicus Brief Submitted by Washington County Public Officials (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2548

Brief of Amicus Curiae Williamsport/Lycoming Chamber of Commerce and Greater Susquehanna Valley Chamber of Commerce Urging this Court to Adopt with One Modification the Special Master’s Report Containing Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law Supporting Recommendation of Congressional Redistricting Plan and Proposed Revision to the 2022 Election Calendar/Schedule .....	A2556
February 23, 2022 Order Adopting Congressional Redistricting Plan, <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2599
Majority Opinion, <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) ....	A2608
Concurring Opinion of Donohue, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2647
Concurring Opinion of Dougherty, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022) .....	A2657
Concurring Opinion of Wecht, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2662
Dissenting Opinion of Brobson, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2682
Dissenting Opinion of Mundy, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2692
Dissenting Opinion of Todd, J., <i>Carter, et al. v. Chapman, et al.</i> , (Pa. No. 7 MM 2022).....	A2713

Walter S. Zimolong III  
Pennsylvania Bar No. 89151  
Zimolong LLC  
Post Office Box 552  
Villanova, Pennsylvania 19085  
(215) 665-0842  
wally@zimolonglaw.com

Jonathan F. Mitchell  
Pennsylvania Bar No. 91505  
Mitchell Law PLLC  
111 Congress Avenue, Suite 400  
Austin, Texas 78701  
(512) 686-3940 (phone)  
(512) 686-3941 (fax)  
jonathan@mitchell.law

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Michael J. Fischer\* (Pa. I.D. No. 322311)  
*Chief Counsel and*  
*Executive Deputy Attorney General*  
Aimee D. Thomson\* (Pa. I.D. No. 326328)  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE OF  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
1600 Arch Street | Suite 300  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(215) 560-2171  
mfischer@attorneygeneral.gov

Joshua Matz\*  
Raymond P. Tolentino\*  
KAPLAN HECKER & FINK LLP  
1050 K Street NW | Suite 1040  
Washington, DC 20001  
(929) 294-2537  
jmatz@kaplanhecker.com  
rtolentino@kaplanhecker.com

Christine P. Sun\*  
Marina Eisner\*  
STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY  
CENTER  
1101 17th Street NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
(240) 600-1316  
christine@statesuniteddemocracy.org  
marina@statesuniteddemocracy.org

Robert A. Wiygul (Pa. I.D. No. 310760)  
Cary L. Rice\* (Pa. I.D. No. 325227)  
John B. Hill\* (Pa. I.D. No. 328340)  
HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL  
PUDLIN & SCHILLER  
One Logan Square, 27th Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(215) 568-6200  
rwiygul@hangley.com

*Counsel for Defendants*

*\*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

Abha Khanna\*  
Elias Law Group LLP  
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100  
Seattle, WA 98101  
akhanna@elias.law  
T: (206) 656-0177

Lalitha D. Madduri\*  
Jyoti Jasrasaria\*  
Christina Ford\*  
Joseph Posimato\*  
Tina Meng\*  
Elias Law Group LLP  
10 G St. NE, Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20002  
lmadduri@elias.law  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
tmeng@elias.law  
T: (202) 968-4490

Matthew Gordon\*  
Perkins Coie LLP  
1201 Third Avenue Suite 4900  
Seattle, WA 98101  
MGordon@perkinscoie.com  
T: (206) 359-3552

Timothy D. Katsiff (PA 75490)  
Edward D. Rogers (PA 69337)\*  
Marcel S. Pratt (PA 307483)\*  
Robert J. Clark (PA 308105)\*  
Michael R. McDonald (PA 326873)\*  
Paul K. Ort (PA 326044)  
Ballard Spahr LLP  
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
KatsiffT@ballardspahr.com  
RogersE@ballardspahr.com  
PrattM@ballardspahr.com  
ClarkR@ballardspahr.com  
McDonaldM@ballardspahr.com  
OrtP@ballardspahr.com  
T: (215) 665-8500  
F: (215) 864-8999

*Counsel for Carter Intervenors*

*\*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 25th day of March 2022, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served upon all counsel of record via the court's CM/ECF electronic filing system.

Dated:        March 25, 2022

/s/ John B. Hill  
John B. Hill